EDIBLE PROVIDENCE INTEGRATING FOOD INTO URBAN PLANNING

KATHERINE BROWN · SHEILA BRUSH

» *From 2003-2015, Providence made significant strides integrating food into urban planning and policy. Throughout Providence, vacant lots and parks have been transformed into productive food gardens and farms; residents now have access to fresh food at farmers' markets, farm stands, restaurants and school lunchrooms; and tons of food waste are composted on a regular basis.* «

THE GROWTH OF PROVIDENCE

In 1636, the Narragensett Indians granted English colonists land-use rights to establish a town on the bank of the Providence River, at the head of the Naragansett Bay. (Today the city is mid-way between Boston and New York.) Providence's original colonists laid out narrow house lots along the eastern bank of the river and used land on the west side of the river as common ground for raising crops and grazing animals. Through the early 1800s, growth centered on the area along the river. Farms ringed the built-up part of town and supplied produce and meat to those in the town center.

Through the early 1800s, Providence grew from rural hamlet to prosperous seaport to early industrial and financial center and overland transportation hub. Later the city experienced a period of rapid industrial expansion. The availability of work in the new factories attracted waves of immigrants, first from England, Scotland and English and French-speaking Canada, and later from Ireland and Italy. The city's population doubled between 1865 and 1880 and doubled again between 1880 and 1910. As manufacturing boomed, factory expansion and housing construction rapidly consumed what had once been open land within the city limits. By 1900, Providence was the 20th largest American city.

The growth of the 19th and early 20th century did not continue. Providence's industrial base eroded steadily after World War II, the population shrank, and the city entered a period of urban decline. Like other American "rust belt" cities,

Figure 1: Once a trash-strewn vacant lot, the 1/2 acre Somerset Garden is now a highly productive source of food for neighborhood families. Photo credit: Lucas Foglia

Figure 2: Providence's immigrant populations bring agricultural savvy from their native countries. Photo credit: Lucas Foglia

Providence was faced with the dire need for both redevelopment and economic repositioning. Efforts in the 1980s and 90s, which combined historic restoration with major redesign and new development, were slow to attract new business. Only now is Providence beginning to see significant new economic growth.

Fortunately, the city is not without multiple assets, including historic and walkable neighborhoods, renowned universities, regional health care centers, an increasingly vibrant arts and cultural scene and a port that serves as a regional distribution point for fuel, salt and raw materials. The city has continued to attract new immigrant populations, who bring energy and entrepreneurial spirit. Of Providence's 178,000 residents, nearly half are Hispanic/Latino, Asian and African[1].

As the city declined, so did farm production. From 1945 through 1992, Rhode Island farms and land in farms decreased by about 80%.and the remaining farmland was under strong development pressure. Providence imported virtually all food from outside the state.

Food production and food waste composting within the city was limited to the occasional backyard gardener, twelve community gardens and a 3/4-acre market farm. Providence's once active food warehousing and market district had virtually disappeared. By 2002, there was only one farmer's market in Providence where Rhode Island farmers sold directly to customers. Beyond recognition that some of Rhode Island's restaurants were gaining regional attention, state and local officials did not view food production, processing and distribution as economic drivers. Nor were rising food insecurity and diet-related health concerns widely recognized.

FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO THE INTEGRATION OF FOOD INTO PROVIDENCE'S URBAN PLANNING AND POLICY

Beginning around 2003, a number of factors combined to draw city government's attention to food system issues and to foster the inclusion of food in city planning and the adoption of city policies supportive of food initiatives.

CITIZEN AND NGO CAPACITY TO ENGAGE WITH CITY

During the 1990s, public interest in local food began to increase in communities across the United States and in other countries. In Rhode Island, the precipitous drop in farm numbers bottomed out, and the state began to see some farm growth. Furthermore, farmers began to capitalize on the increased public interest in local food by marketing directly to consumers, thereby increasing their profits. In Providence, a nascent groundswell of community support for the local food system was forming. Supporters included: food growers, many of whom were recent immigrants who brought their agricultural know-how from Asia, Africa, and the Caribbean; young adults who embraced the local food movement and urban gardening; and, environmentalists whose sustainability goals overlapped with urban agriculture.

This upsurge in interest was inspired and urged on by the work of Providence's earliest food-related NGO, the Southside Community Land Trust (SCLT). Founded in 1981, SCLT is the first, and remains the nation's only, community land trust that is uniquely dedicated to urban agriculture. Community Land Trusts in the United States exist in many forms with the common purpose of holding land in order to address a range of community needs. Most have focused on affordable homeownership.[2] SCLT's three decade-long dedication to urban agriculture has been a notable exception until recently when a number of others expanded their goals to include agriculture. By 2003, SCLT had established ten community gardens and one three quarter acre market farm inside Providence and it also managed a 50-acre farm just outside the city limits.

Figure 3: The next generation of growers. Photo credit: Southside Community Land Trust

Concerns about gaps in the local food system led to the establishment of several additional NGOs that complemented Southside Community Land Trust's agriculture programs, and by 2003 Providence's NGO community had developed the organizational capacity necessary to mobilize community constituencies and engage with city government.

In 2004, the Southside Community Land Trust took the lead in advocating for Providence's local food system when it launched the Providence Urban Agriculture Task Force (UATF). With a defined mission of creating community food systems where locally produced, affordable, and healthy food is available to all, SCLT's leadership brought to the table three elements: 1. on the ground evidence of the benefits of urban agriculture with their gardens and farms; 2. a network of growers who provided a ready constituency of support; and, 3. a recognition of the importance of municipal policy change if the food system was to make significant advances.

SCLT's goal for the UATF was to coalesce NGO and community interests thereby ensuring city residents access to affordable, fresh, locally grown and culturally-appropriate food. In keeping with SCLT's system-wide perspec-

tive and the priorities of their USDA Food Project grant program[3], UATF members organized around a food system model, seeking long-term citywide systemic changes. Interpreting "urban agriculture" broadly, they collaborated to identify policies and projects to: increase the amount of food raised in Providence and surrounding municipalities; facilitate healthy food access, especially for low-income consumers; integrate food with housing and community development; compost food waste; and, negotiate farm-to-school purchasing agreements between the Providence School Department and Rhode Island farmers.

UATF's 40-members included farmers, gardeners, NGOs, food and health professionals, environmentalists, and City and State staff and policy-makers. The members' diverse individual agendas included public health and nutrition, food security, housing and community development, environmental protection, youth betterment, anti-poverty and racism, immigrant and refugee resettlement, farm viability and economic development.

CONSISTENT POLITICAL LEADERSHIP VISION OF A GREEN FUTURE

Starting in 2003 three different mayors[4] began the City's commitment to food initiatives. During this period, cities and mayors in particular, were taking a lead on climate change and sustainability issues. Providence's mayors and several council members were among those who committed to work on these critical issues. Sustainability and climate change not only provided a larger policy umbrella under which food system issues could be treated, but food issues were often easier to discuss with the public than more complex subjects such as climate change and alternative energy.

An example of this commitment was the *2008 Greenprint Providence report* issued by Mayor Cicilline. This report summarizing the City's vision to "reduce global warming, pollution and to position Providence as a leader in the rapidly growing green economy." The report's section on Open Space stated that "community gardens and urban agriculture build community, foster cultural identify and connections, engage residents in the stewardship of land, and provide affordable produce."

Once the initial commitment to addressing food issues was made, subsequent administrations and councils continued the food initiative momentum. The city government moved from a focus on local food production at a neighborhood level to a systems-level perspective. Successive administrations not only continued to build on the goals, organizational changes and programmatic strategies initiated by their predecessors, but in many cases retained key personnel.

CITY SUPPORT FOR CITIZEN PARTICIPATION IN PLANNING

Soon after Mayor Cicilline's 2003 inauguration, the Providence's Department of Planning and Development (Planning Department) began to map out the process for creating a new Local Comprehensive Plan. Whereas previous plans had been developed using a "top down" approach, this time neighborhood associations and community residents called for a planning process that incorporated input from citizens across the city. In response, the Planning Department announced that its plan development process would include a citywide charrette in the fall of 2006, after which an interim Local Comprehensive Plan would be adopted. The process continued with a series of neighborhood charrettes in 2007-2009, and culminated in neighborhood plans and a final Local Comprehensive Plan.

The Planning Department's emphasis on public engagement provided an ideal opportunity for UATF members to garner municipal support for the policy changes they were advocating. They focused their efforts on incorporating language into the neighborhood plans and the Comprehensive Plan that would increase food production in Providence by enabling the development of new community gardens and market farms on City-owned property. One of the UATF's first steps was to invite Mayor Cicilline to visit SCLT's City Farm and speak with UATF members. The Mayor remembers his visit as a turning-point in his own understanding of the value of growing food in the city:

Figure 4: Cambodian monks bless an urban farm. Photo credit: Lucas Foglia

"At City Farm, seeing Dominican, Laotian, Haitian, and white interns working together, I understood immediately how powerful food gardens and farms in the city can be. These youth(s) were learning environmental stewardship, growing food for their families, and improving blighted lots. I was impressed to see how much food could be grown in a small space. I remember thinking here's a win-win model we can use all over the city".[5]

Other UATF efforts included publishing *Urban Agriculture in Providence: growing our community by growing good food* that made the case for including urban agriculture in the new Comprehensive Plan[6]; issuing a white paper for planning professionals entitled Planning for Appropriately Scaled Agriculture in Providence[7]; and submitting specific draft language to be considered for inclusion in the Comprehensive Plan that would increase food production in Providence.

UATF also spread word about the Planning Department's charrettes among food advocates and helped empower non-English speaking growers to present their interests at those public charrettes. This reinforced the Mayor and Planning Department's growing recognition that community gardens were a priority for many residents. As David Everett, one of the City's planners who staffed the public charrettes remembers, "Many at the City level didn't acknowledge urban farmers as much more than a fringe element, and even I came to realize the network was larger than I'd imagined."[8]

Garry Bliss, then Director of Community Development, summed up the effectiveness of the UATF's engagement with the city's planning process as follows:

"What the pro-urban ag folks did is a textbook example of effective engagement with municipal government. Their outreach helped policy makers and staff understand what urban ag could do. They offered successful on-the-ground examples so urban agriculture was not an abstraction. Their efforts complemented the government's process."[9]

NEW APPROACH TO CITY HALL STRUCTURE

There also was recognition within City Hall that complex issues such as environmental sustainability could most effectively be addressed through involvement and collaboration of multiple departments, the assistance of professional organizations and financial support from outside of government. It also became recognized that the city needed to expand its in-house organizations to formally address these complex issues.

In 2008, the City Council passed an ordinance that established the Environmental Sustainability Task Force and created the position of Sustainability Director. The ordinance responded to growing concern about sustainability and signaled the City's increased readiness to invite on-going NGO and academic participation in planning and policymaking. It directed the Task Force to work with the Office of Sustainability, the Mayor, the City Council and other city departments to coordinate and provide public accountability, transparency, and accessibility regarding the City's environmental agenda and propose innovative, achievable environmental initiatives.

From the first, local food system advocates have been represented on the Environmental Sustainability Task Force, ensuring that food issues are brought to the City's attention.

In 2012, Mayor Taveras established the Healthy Communities Office. Healthy Communities was charged with soliciting community input, establishing creative partnership across City departments and with the city's NGOs, and leveraging funds to create healthier outcomes for city residents. Its responsibilities include food system changes to improve nutrition and increase access to healthy foods. Like the Sustainability Office, Healthy Communities demonstrates the City's commitment to innovative structures within government to address system-wide responses to complex problems.

THE INTEGRATION OF FOOD INTO URBAN PLANNING

THE ADOPTED PLAN AND ORDINANCES

In 2007, following the active engagement of food system advocates in public planning charrettes, the City published *Providence Tomorrow: The Interim Comprehensive Plan.* Between 2009-2010, it also published a series of neighborhood plans to summarize the findings of the Planning Department's neighborhood charrettes and prioritize recommended actions.[10] Both the interim comprehensive plan and most of the neighborhood plans discussed the importance of providing community gardens and farming opportunities.

The City also referenced community gardens in another essential planning document – the Consolidated Plan. In order to receive certain Federal funds, the City is required to prepare a Consolidated Plan, in which it sets forth its priorities for housing and community development. Providence's 2005 and 2010 Consolidated Plans identified community gardens as a community development strategy, and thus allowed for distribution of Federal funding to promote community gardens.

Providence Tomorrow: The Final Comprehensive Plan, adopted in 2014, built on the foundational work contained in the Interim Comprehensive Plan and in the series of Neighborhood Plans. Developed in-house, the Final Plan provided even more robust treatment of food system objectives and strategies related to various components of the food system.

The Plan's Sustainability Element includes strategies to:

- Establish guidelines and amend regulations as necessary to promote appropriately-scaled, hand-tended agriculture, including community gardens as a temporary or long-term use of surplus or temporarily vacant City property and the Rhode Island Department of Transportation.
- Establish a goal that every Providence resident live within a ten-minute walk of a community garden.
- Promote CSA (community-supported agriculture) co-ops and the health benefits of local produce.

- Investigate innovative solutions to provide accessible and affordable water service for community gardening as needed.
- Support "vertical farming" whereby existing buildings and other structures can be used for growing.

The Sustainability Element also calls for "maintaining and supporting existing and proposed recycling and composting programs, supporting the establishment of a sustainable regional or municipal composting facility, and amending regulations as necessary, to support composting programs."[11]

The Business and Jobs Element recognizes urban agriculture as part of neighborhood economic development and includes a strategy of identifying and preserving "areas suitable for urban agriculture." Its strategies for neighborhood economic development include strengthening programs that support small business and neighborhood revitalization, such as Neighborhood Markets, micro-loans and storefront improvement grants. While these strategies do not identify neighborhood groceries and corner markets explicitly, such businesses, many of which meet neighborhood cultural food demands, are key elements of neighborhood business mix.

Recognizing "Providence's role as the economic center of the state," the Business and Jobs Element presents a strategy to "Support local agriculture through farm-to-school and farm-to-government programs that link local farmers to schools and encourage government purchasing of local produce.

The Land Use Element includes community gardens as a neighborhood revitalization strategy in residential neighborhoods and reiterates the importance of identifying city and state-owned open spaces best suited for agriculture, amending regulations as necessary "to facilitate urban agriculture" and "to promote a system of farmers' markets throughout the city."[12]

The City's new *Zoning Ordinance,* adopted in 2014-2015, permits plant agriculture by right in 16 of the City's 20 zoning districts and permits mobile food sales (with a temporary use permit) in 14 districts, and Farmers Markets (with a temporary use permit) in 17 districts. Use standards are provided in all cases. Apiaries, aquaculture/aquaponic facilities, chicken coops and coldframe structures are permitted as accessory structures in all districts unless specifically prohibited by the ordinance. The definitions section also notes that Light Industrial Uses include aquaculture/aquaponic facilities.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF OTHER IMPORTANT CITY PLANS

The 2014 *Sustainable Providence Food Plan*[13] is a policy statement that deserves mention, although it is not a legally binding planning document. Produced by the Sustainability Office and

Figure 5: Permitted in 17 of 20 districts, farmers markets provide access to fresh produce and give community growers a place to sell their products. Photo credit: Southside Community Land Trust

the Environmental Sustainability Task Force, the *Sustainable Providence Food Plan* is a strong expression of the Administration's commitment to a strengthened food system and the definition of metrics to measure progress.

One of six sections of the *Sustainable Providence* policy document, the *Food Plan* was developed via a series open meetings with community partners. Providence's Food Plan sets goals for production, processing, distribution and consumption and incorporates equity and environmental considerations. It states:

"Providence is part of a local and regional food system and has a critical role to play in ensuring that this system: A) Provides every Providence resident with access to safe, affordable, nutritious, and culturally appropriate food; B) Cultivates a healthy environment in Providence by striving for zero waste, adopting ecologically sound and sustainable practices, and ensuring healthy, fair, and just working conditions and wages; C) Contributes to the state and city's economy by supporting long-term economic development opportunities in the food sector."[14]

One final document should be mentioned. In November 2015, the Department of Economic Development released the City of Providence's *Economic Development Cluster Strategy*, which identified the food cluster as one of the areas on which Providence's economic development efforts should concentrate. The report notes:

"There is a concentration and growth in the entire regional food-related supply chain from farms to food processing to food sales and more. The state as a whole and the city in particular has opportunities to realize additional economic benefit from this cluster as national trends towards locally sourced products and global food security trends drive local opportunities."[15]

The report recommends feasibility research for a co-packing facility, refrigerated distribution space and food manufacturing, processing, and sales businesses, improved services, incentives, programs and zoning to support food-based businesses; workforce training; and outreach to private equity firms, highlighting food as a unique opportunity. Since the report's release, the Department of Economic Development has begun to develop specific proposals to implement the report's recommendations.

Referring to the *Sustainable Providence Food Plan* and the *Economic Development Cluster Strategy*, Planning Deputy Director, Robert Azar stated, "While these aren't planning documents like a comprehensive plan, I foresee us incorporating elements of both documents into the next iteration of the comp plan."[16]

Figure 6: The on-going success of community gardens depends on regular meetings among each garden's growers. Photo credit: Southside Community Land Trust

EXAMPLES OF ON-THE-GROUND CITY-NGO COLLABORATION

COMMUNITY GARDENS IN PUBLIC PARKS

Under Mayor Cicilline's administration the Board of Parks Commissioners approved language that permitted the Parks Department to work with neighbors and NGOs to establish community gardens in City parks.

The Parks Department's model is to provide a community garden in a public park only when the neighboring community requests the garden. The Parks Department covers capital costs for fencing, garden beds and water lines, and assumes on-going responsibility for water, repairs, and compost. Neighbors must commit to helping with the initial garden build-out and commit to taking responsibility for ongoing garden management. NGOs support this effort by mobilizing neighbors and providing community education, collaborating on grant applications for funding, and partnering with the Parks Department on community events. By 2016, the Parks Department had responded to neighborhood requests to install twelve community gardens and one fruit orchard.

LOTS OF HOPE

Lots of Hope is a collaboration between the Sustainability and Healthy Communities Offices, Planning Department, and food advocates. Where community gardens make it possible for people to grow food for their own families, with *Lots of Hope* the City and partnering NGOs offer people the opportunity to grow food to sell. The initiative seeks "to institutionalize urban agriculture and position the City as an urban agriculture advocate to help farmers navigate… bureaucratic challenges associated with acquiring land."[17] The program aligns with both Offices' goal of creating a community food system where locally produced, healthy, and affordable food is accessible to everyone.

Using the Planning Department's inventory of City-owned vacant lots, the *Lots of Hope* project team used lot size, orientation to the sun, tree canopy coverage and other factors to identify lots appropriate for urban agriculture. The project has created four urban farms to date, leasing land and greenhouse space to limited-resource market growers and community gardeners. It is committed to establishing an additional lot each year.

PROVIDENCE COMPOSTS!

Food waste composting is crucial to sustainable urban metabolism.[18] Providence currently sends an estimated 10,000 tons of food waste annually to the state's landfill. *ProvIdence COMPOSTS!* is one of many measures aimed to reach the City's goal of zero waste by 2033. The Offices of Sustainability and Healthy Communities piloted the program with NGOs and residents in two neighborhoods. The program has since expanded to eight community collec-

Figure 7: The Providence City Parks Department, the Southside Community Land Trust, the International Institute, an elderly high rise building and a shelter for battered women partnered to launch the Cadillac Drive garden. Photo credit: Southside Community Land Trust

tion sites. Two hundred neighbors receive pails and training, and deliver their food scraps to composting sites including Lots of Hope farms and the West Elmwood Housing Development Corporation's Sankofa Urban Agriculture Village. *Providence COMPOSTS!* will divert more than ten tons of residential food scraps from the landfill each year, complementing the thousand tons hauled from institutions by The Compost-Plant, a new local commercial composter.

FOOD AS A FORCE FOR COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: THE WEST END AND THE SANKOFA INTIATIVE

The West End is Providence's largest and most densely populated neighborhood, with 20,560 people per square mile. The majority of West End residents are Hispanic (58.1%), and forty-one percent are foreign born, having immigrated from a variety of Hispanic, African, and Asian countries. The historic housing stock ranges from Victorian mansions to triple-decker working-class homes.

After decades of decline, recent community redevelopment efforts have returned much of the neighborhood's housing to relatively good condition. Small storefront businesses line the neighborhood's commercial streets, but the West End is by no means economically flourishing. The median household income is $32,899, with an unemployment rate of 9.7%; 41.4% of West End residents do not have vehicle access and 33% receive federal food assistance.

By the 1980s most of the neighborhood's manufacturing companies had closed, leaving many acres of abandoned and polluted land where factories once stood. The Planning Department's re-zoning of this land to mixed-use in the late 1990s enabled the West Elmwood Housing Development Corporation (WEHDC) and others to begin the steady process of revisioning this neglected part of the West End for new housing and other purposes.

Since the early 2000s, the WEHDC and others have recognized food as a driver for neighborhood betterment. The Southside Community Land Trust had already created five community gardens in the West End in the 1990s. After 2003, food production increased with the addition of nine new community gardens established by SCLT, WEHDC, and other NGOs. Two new market farms (one of them part of the City's Lots of Hope program) now sell produce to local restaurants. In 2013 Cluck!, a farm and garden supply business, opened in the West End to serve Providence's urban food growers.

The neighborhood now includes forty-one markets, a sidewalk tropical fruit stand business and Farm Fresh RI's Armory Parade Street Farmers Market. Nonetheless, food access remains a problem for residents – particularly access to fresh and culturally desirable produce. Furthermore, food insecurity continues to plague the West End. Many families report they are not able to afford a balanced diet. The West End's nine food pantries, three congregate meal sites, and homeless shelter routinely operate at full capacity.

In 2011 the WEHDC launched its Sankofa Initiative to "to foster the cultivation of land, lives and community". In 2014, the WEHDC established the Sankofa World Market as an outdoor venue for neighborhood residents to sell and buy locally produced food along with value-added food products and artisan wares. In 2015, WEHDC documented the neighborhood's food access and security challenges in a comprehensive Sankofa Food Assessment with the State Department of Health. In 2016, the Sankofa Initiative will augment its existing gardens with the cultivation of an additional 16,500 square feet of land for community gardens and market farms next to WEHDC's 50-unit, $15 million low-income Sankofa Apartments. The project will include a community kitchen, a greenhouse and other season extension infrastructure (to expand the growing season for urban farmers) as well as composting and food storage facilities. The Sankofa Initiative will "create new opportunities for West End residents to grow, market and sell local and culturally appropriate foods, value-added food products and other artisan wares and to create increased opportunities for meaningful connections among residents."[19]

Figure 8: Gardens strengthen neighborhoods by fostering cross cultural and cross generational connections. Photo credit: Lucas Foglia

CONCLUSIONS

From 2003-2015, Providence made significant strides integrating food into urban planning and policy. Throughout Providence, vacant lots and parks have been transformed into productive food gardens and farms; residents now have access to fresh food at farmers' markets, farm stands, restaurants and school lunchrooms; and tons of food waste are composted on a regular basis. These local food initiatives provide cost-effective, tangible ways for the City to respond to the expressed needs of an engaged and diverse constituency of residents and NGOs.

The City's planning process first provided the opportunity for NGOs and community advocates to draw attention to the positive revitalization, environmental and social impacts that community gardens and market farms could have on urban neighborhoods. The City's commitment to addressing food issues was documented through the inclusion of food issues and strategies in planning documents, most notably the current Local Comprehensive Plan: *Providence Tomorrow* and the City's Zoning Ordinance. The Comprehensive Plan and the Zoning Ordinance established the foundation that the City needed to launch its work.

The speed with which the City integrated food into urban planning and the direction that food policy has taken in Providence were due to several factors that include:

- NGO capacity to participate in the planning process and mobilize diverse constituencies
- Consistency of vision on the part of elected officials, the Planning Department and other staff;
- Changes in the City's planning process that enabled residents and NGOs to advocate for food system support;
- Innovations in the structure of City Hall offices that supported collaborative effort across government and between government and NGOs.

In order to fully understand the approach that Providence is using to broaden its approach of food issues, it is important to note that several city offices and departments, in addition to the Planning Department, play important roles. The Sustainability and Healthy Communities Offices, were created to enable the city to better address complex systemic issues and to engage the private sector in contributing expertise and resources to City initiatives. Their work related to food includes: the preparation of policy documents which expand public-private collaboration; the provision of policy guidance; and, the establishment of implementation strategies and progress indicators. The Department of Economic Development's focus on the food sector proposes opportunities to significantly expand food-based businesses within the City.

Thus, coordinated effort by the Planning Department and other offices enables the City to work comprehensively to strengthen Providence's food system components – from production to processing to distribution to access to food waste re-use – and to address food system issues at a systemic level.

Additional planning work will be essential to advance new strategies and recommendations. The commitment of elected officials, the planning work of the past twelve years and the effective collaborative processes between city staff and private sector interests have created a strong foundation for future urban planning initiatives. ◆

ENDNOTES

1 US Census. (2015) State and County Quick Facts, Providence. http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/44/4459000.html

2 Rosenberg, G and Yuen, J. (2012) Beyond Housing: Urban Agriculture and Commercial Development by Community Land Trusts. Lincoln Institute of Land Policy. http://community-wealth.org/sites/clone.community wealth.org/files/downloads/paper-rosenburg-yuen.pdf

3 Started in 1996, the United States Department of Agricutlure's Community Food Projects Competitive Grant Program (CFPCGP) funds community-based multi-sector collaborations to fight food insecurity by strengthening the self-sufficiency of low-income communities to meet their food needs. Community Food Projects take a whole food system perspective to develop long-term, system-wide solutions. https://nifa.usda.gov/program/community-food-projects-competitive-grant-program-cfpcgp

4 David Cicilline (now US Congressman Cicilline) 2003- 2010; Angel Taveras 2011- 2014; Jorge Elorza 2015-present.

5 Cicilline, David. (30th December 2015) in person.

6 Urban Agriculture Task Force. (2005) Urban Agriculture in Providence: growing our community by growing good food. http://www.dem.ri.gov/programs/bnatres/agricult/pdf/urbanag.pdfthat

7 Morton, B. (2006) Planning for Appropriately Scaled Agriculture in Providence, Urban Agriculture Task Force. http://community-wealth.org/sites/clone.community-wealth.org/files/downloads/paper-morton.pdf

8 Everett, David. (21st December 2015) in person.

9 Bliss, Garry. (14th January 2016) in person.

10 Providence Tomorrow The Interim Comprehensive Plan. (2007) http://www.gcpvd.org/images/reports/2007-12-providence-tomorrow-the-interim-comprehensive-plan.pdf.

11 Providence Tomorrow.

12 Providence Tomorrow.

13 Sustainable Providence, "Food Plan." (2014) 23-30. https://www.providenceri.com/efile/5705

14 Sustainable Providence, "Food Plan." 23

15 City of Providence RI Economic Development Cluster Strategy. November 18, 2015. Fourth Economy. http://council.providenceri.com/efile/224

16 Azar, Robert. (April 27, 2016) e-mail correspondence.

17 Lots of Hope. An Urban Agriculture Assessment with the City of Providence. (2014),6, https://www.providenceri.com/efile/5537.

18 Tornaghi C, Sage C, Dehaene M. (2005) Urban Metabolism and Urban Agriculture: How might growing food in cities 'mend' the metabolic rift?
to be produced as part of the work of COST Action TD1106 'Urban Agriculture Europe'. https://www.academia.edu/14720059/Urban_Metabolism_and_Urban_Agriculture_How_might_growing_food_in_cities_mend_the_metabolic_rift

19 Sankofa West End Community Food Security Assessment. (2015) West Elmwood Housing Community Development Corporation's "Sankofa Initiative" and the RI State Department of Health's Center for Health Equity and Wellness. P 7